

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF WATERVLIET
THURSDAY, APRIL 19, 2012 AT 7:00 P.M.**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Michael P. Manning at 7:00 P.M.

Roll call showed that Mayor Michael P. Manning, Councilwoman Ellen R. Fogarty and Councilman Nicholas W. Foglia were present.

Also present from City Administration were: Mark Gleason; General Manager, Yorden Huban, Corporation Counsel, Bruce A. Hidley, City Clerk and Clerk to the Council, Rosemary Nichols, Deputy General Manager of Economic Development and Planning, Mark Gilchrist, Assessor/Building Inspector, Fire Chief Scott Skinner and Police Chief Ron Boisvert.

A motion was made and seconded to dispense with and accept the minutes from the previous City Council Meeting.

REPORT OF OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES

ITEM #1 – Mark Gleason, General Manager introduced to the Council Bob Sweeney an attorney representing NIGRO Companies. Mr. Sweeney explained to all in attendance that tonight he will be presenting the entire proposal for the entire assembly to see. Mr. Sweeney introduced Mona and Jerry Golub from the Price Chopper Corporation, Scott Nigro and Steve Powers from NIGRO Companies and Father Ed Daimeke from the Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish. Mr. Sweeney explained that the nature of this public meeting is for Mr. Sweeney to present the information NIGRO Companies has provided to the City of Watervliet in connection with the application. Mr. Sweeney noted that the first week of March NIGRO Companies filed a petition with the City Council to rezone the St. Patrick's parcel from Residential 3 to a Business 1 Zone to accommodate commercial development. That business would be a Price Chopper Supermarket and one smaller business. Mr. Sweeney explained that they need the business zoned to proceed with the project proposed. The rezoning is a legislative act by the City Council. They have to pass legislation to change the Zoning Map of the City of Watervliet. The process currently ongoing is a legislative process for the City. It is a detailed process and there are a number of steps that the City Council must take. There is a proceeding under the State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) where in addition to evaluating the merits of the rezoning the City Council evaluates the potential environmental impact from the use proposed at the site. The City Council must make a determination under SEQRA that this project will not have a significant impact on the environment before consideration of the rezoning. These two processes will move along together. The law requires that the City Council conduct a Public hearing which is a formally convened meeting where anyone from the public has the right to speak on the record for the City Council. The City Council as is its practice allows the public to speak at every forum. This will be a separate meeting for the public where they have a legally recognized opportunity to ask questions and make comments in the City Council record. Mr. Sweeney stated that they don't need any variances or other types of permits or approvals. In addition to the rezoning by the City Council there is also a referral from the City Council to the City Planning Board.

The Planning Board will receive the application package, NIGRO Company will appear before that Board and pretty much do the same thing as tonight's presentation. In addition the City Council is required to send this application to the Albany County Planning Board. The Albany County Planning Board will pretty much do the same thing. They will consider the application and they will make a recommendation to the City Council. All of these meetings before and review by other Boards will take place before the City Council will make a final determination on the application. This is pretty much an overview of what the process is. The application before the City Council is within their discretion to approve or not approve it. They are required to consider the City's Comprehensive Plan in doing that. NIGRO Company has in the City Council record and available for review if anybody wants to look at it a substantial package of materials. Tonight you will hear from several of the experts who have contributed to this document. They will have a detailed explanation of what is in the record for the public to look at. Mr. Sweeney introduced Fr. Ed Deimeke from Immaculate Heart Mary of Parish. Fr. Deimeke explained that three worship sites were closed by November 2006. There were three left remaining at this point. The building committee pointed out that within a couple of years it was fiscally impossible to maintain three worship sites. At this point a Building Committee was formed. Each of the six previous church parishes was represented on this committee. On March 1, 2010 a report was made to the parish after evaluating all of the options, St. Joseph's, St. Brigid's, St. Patrick's and Immaculate Conception as well as Our Lady of Mt. Carmel. The recommendation from the Building Committee was to renovate the former Immaculate Conception Church. It met the needs size wise, the parish could afford this. When the committee looked at St. Brigid's, it was in the wrong place, St. Joseph's, it was in the wrong place, St. Patrick's was in the right place but there were financial considerations, it was too cost prohibitive. At this point it became public knowledge that St. Joseph's, St. Brigid's and St. Patrick's churches would eventually close. The committee closed St. Joseph's in August of 2010, they closed St. Brigid's in June of 2011 and St. Patrick's in September of 2011. Since the time the announcement was made for consolidation there have been five offers for St. Patrick's property. None of the offers came from a religious organization. All of the offers indicated they would not be able to use the St. Patrick's building. The NIGRO Companies was the most attractive. That's why they accepted the NIGRO offer. There are engineering reports available in exhibits 12 and 13 which indicate the repairs that are needed for St. Patrick's Church, they are extensive. In fact the most recent ones are a need for extensive repointing on the exterior which adds a lot more money. This is why they have offered St. Patrick's Church for sale. Mr. Sweeney noted that this is the material on record and available for inspection. An architectural firm that has done a review of the building and some of the deficiencies in the building is Butler, Roland and Mays. There is an engineering firm Ryan Biggs Associates who detailed the deficiencies along with the cost of repair which is pushing 6 million dollars to stabilize and get the church to a point where it can be used. That is the financial part that fueled the decision of the diocese and parish. This building is at a point where they put on the market. That was the amount to put the building back to a safe and solid condition. This fueled the need to move in this direction.

Mr. Sweeney introduced the project engineer from Bergmann Associates who discussed the development proposal for the St. Patrick's site. A detailed analysis was given to all in attendance related to the proposal. This included site size, zoning of site, setbacks, green space, parking, vehicle access, truck access, stormwater, drainage, sewer locations, impact of where buildings are located, site operations, shopping cart issue, trash storage, trash pickup, litter/debris, snow removal and landscaping plan. Actual pictures of the site location were exhibited for the public to see.

Mr. Sweeney introduced Wendy Holzberger of Creighton Manning Engineering who is the traffic consultants for the St. Patrick's project. Ms. Holzberger provided all in attendance with an overview of the traffic study conducted by her firm. Ms. Holzberger also stated that there is a full blown detailed traffic assessment which may be reviewed. The study was done between the hours of 4:00 PM and 6:00 PM which is considered peak traffic hours. They also studied the Saturday retail facility conditions. They also have the 19th Street traffic data. They take the existing volumes and project them to a future condition for the design year 2014. Ms. Holzberger then noted the peak hour traffic results from her study. Ms. Holzberger discussed the traffic signal, 5th Ave. parking and truck traffic issues related to traversing this area.

Mr. Sweeney then turned the proposal over to the representatives from Price Chopper to discuss current store issues along with the new store proposal.

Chuck Chisholm who acts as the real estate coordinator for Price Chopper Corporation showed the slide with the existing Price Chopper. The current Price Chopper is 23,500 square feet. The new Price Chopper would be a 40% increase to 40,000 square feet. The current store was last renovated in 1982. The existing store does not have the capability to expand its current location due to the lack of land and the configuration of the store. The proposed store will generate approximately \$126,000 in additional real estate taxes. The existing store pays approximately \$50,000. The current store is company owned and will be replaced with another retail business. Price Chopper will continue to pay the taxes on that property. The enlarged store it is anticipated will raise approximately \$110,000 in sales tax revenue. They believe that the new store will be an anchor on 19th Street and will regenerate businesses on 19th Street. The new Price Chopper will also employ 40 new employees to work.

Mr. Chisholm then turned the program over to Steve Duffy who is Vice President of Price Chopper Corporation. Mr. Duffy explained that the new Price Chopper would be much more efficient such as energy, water along with newer technology. The new store will include expanded service meat departments, seafood department, expanded produce department, providing a variety of other fresh foods. There will be a significant increase in the variety of beverages food products and other items.

Mr. Duffy then introduced Jerry Golub who is President and COO of Price Chopper Corporation. Mr. Golub explained that Price Chopper opened its first store in 1932 in Green Island. In 1933 Price Chopper opened its 2nd store in Watervliet. Mr. Golub looks to become a good community member for many years to come. The current site expanded in 1982 to its current size. At the time this was a new modern store but since that time things have changed. The store is currently outdated and too small for them to provide this community the type of supermarket needed in this community. Many customers leave Watervliet to get the products they need on a daily basis. Expanding in the current site would have been the first priority but is impossible. The Price Chopper Corporation has been searching for a site for a lot of years that would be suitable until now. They are excited about the opportunity to offer a supermarket that the community deserves. Mr. Golub understands that the church has played a special place and role in the lives of many residents and some would still love to see the church preserved. Given everything known to this point especially the fact that nobody has come forward with a viable plan that would preserve this structure. They feel that this project proposed tonight would provide the community with the greatest amount of benefits all things considered. That includes all the financial benefits that you heard about related to taxes, additional jobs in addition to the revitalization of the 19th Street corridor and the quality of life improvements that come from having a state of the art supermarket. Mr. Golub wanted to be clear on one point it is not their intent to force this project on the community. They view this as a participant process and they will listen to everything and everyone has to say along the way. If during this approval process if someone were to come forward with a viable alternative plan that meets the needs of the parish that will preserve this building we they will encourage the parish to review that plan and make and make an appropriate decision. Mr. Golub stated that he is going into this with an open mind and he hopes everyone will do the same. That way all will be able to focus and ask the following question. What solution is in the best long term interest of this community? Mr. Golub is looking forward to that discussion. Mr. Sweeney announced to the City Council that this concludes the proposal regarding the St. Patrick's Church property proposal.

Mayor Manning stated that proposal was introduced a couple of meetings ago. It was very limited in details when it was first presented. The proposal tonight has a lot more details. Mayor Manning noted that the City Council will hold a Public Hearing specifically on this issue, not at a Council Meeting. The book Mr. Sweeney is referring to has been scanned and will be put on the website tomorrow. All the exhibits and presentations will be there. The City will hold the Public Comment Period later tonight. There will be a specific detailed meeting on this proposal. It will be a couple of weeks no sooner than May 17th. Mayor Manning will be sure that all meetings will be posted on the website. What happened tonight is the Council received a proposal to rezone this parcel which would allow the developer to push forward with this plan. The process is really starting. The City Council will make some referrals to the Watervliet Planning Board and the Albany County Planning Board. The City will also make a declaration about SEQRA declaring the City Council as Lead Agency. In the business section of tonight's meeting that is what will be voted on. All these referrals have time limits to get back to the City Council. The Watervliet Planning Board meets next Wednesday. This was done to present the information it is not what the Council is going with. The process will continue with input from the public.

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

RESOLUTION NO. 8826 – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes Hacker & Murphy, LLP, David Murphy, Esq. of Counsel to effectuate a voluntary settlement and discontinuance of the pending special proceedings for assessment review between the City of Watervliet and 2550 9th Avenue, LLC for the years 2011 thru 2014. Before voting Mayor Manning explained that this is a tax settlement. The City often gets sued for the assessment assigned to large commercial spaces. The City's outside Counsel and the petitioner's attorney have agreed to a settlement. This Resolution authorizes the settlement agreement. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

RESOLUTION NO. 8827 – A Resolution declaring the City of Watervliet City Council as the Lead Agency for State Environmental Quality Review Act purposes, referring rezoning petition of NIGRO Companies, Inc. to the Albany County Planning Board pursuant to General Municipal Law §239-m and pursuant to §272-39 of the Code of the City of Watervliet, referring the rezoning petition of NIGRO Companies, Inc. to the City of Watervliet Planning Board for the final report under §57-8 of the City Code. Before voting Mayor Manning stated that this is a Resolution declaring the City as Lead Agent for the SEQRA process and referring this proposal to the two Planning Boards as part of the process. Upon motion of Councilwoman Fogarty, seconded by Councilman Foglia, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

APPROPRIATIONS AND ACCOUNTING

RESOLUTION NO. 8828 – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes the transfer of \$39,000.00 from the Police Payroll Account to the Police Special Wages Account for the 207-C wages paid for the months of January, February and March 2012. Before voting Mayor Manning explained that this is a budget neutral transfer. The City has to keep money in payroll accounts for wages paid to Workers Compensation who are injured or disabled. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

Robert A. Fahr, Director of Finance explained to the Council that the fund balance at the end of 2011 came in at 1,043,000.00 in the General Fund, the Water Fund, balance was \$482,000.00 and the Sewer Fund balance was \$143,000.00. These figures are as of today's audit.

Before moving into the Public Comment Period Mayor Manning announced that on Friday, April 20th there will be a spaghetti and meatball fundraiser for the Senior Services of Watervliet. The event will take place from 3:30 until 7:00 P.M.

The annual KEEP VLIET NEAT DAY will be held on Saturday, April 21st beginning at 8:00 A.M. For those who wish to participate they will meet at the DOME. Refreshments will be served immediately following the cleanup.

The City received word from the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission that the City has been approved for the proposed Hydro Project in Rome, NY. The City may proceed with the traditional licensing.

The City's Bulk Item Disposal Week will be from April 23 thru April 26. Residents are to place their debris out the same day as the regular garbage pickup. This is done by the traditional 4'x4'x8' rectangular amount of debris.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Lori Sylvester – 1904 8th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Sylvester stated that she was very excited about the prospect of a new Price Chopper coming into town. Ms. Sylvester received a letter from the Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish regarding the condition of the church. What have occurred to her are the people who are responsible for maintaining this property. If it is that special and treasured why is it now \$5,000,000.00 plus is a state of decay. Ms. Sylvester noted that the time to take care of this was the past. Now she feels they need to move on. Ms. Sylvester thanked all the presenters for the presentation of the new Price Chopper.

David Sylvester – 1904 8th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Sylvester stated that he thinks the Council will hear a lot of powerful rhetoric tonight. At the last meeting somebody got up and made a comment that the developers do not live in our City. After listening tonight he realized the oldest resident in Watervliet is the Golub Corporation. Mr. Sylvester realizes that there is a lot of concern about placing a large commercial business in a residential neighborhood. Mr. Sylvester feels that the residents of 6th Avenue and 23rd Street have some legitimate concerns which need to be addressed by the developer, Golub Corporation, Planning Board and the City Council. Mr. Sylvester can't think of a better corporate neighbor than Golub Corporation. Mr. Sylvester also stated that whenever you pick up a newspaper you see something good the Golub Corporation has done. Mr. Sylvester feels that we should be lucky that Golub Corporation is interested in maintaining an investment in the City of Watervliet. The City of Watervliet has a chance to be something that several communities are and that's a pedestrian friendly community. This is a good step towards that. He is hoping the City Council will do what is best for the entire City of Watervliet and see that this project gets done.

Pat Fularo, Jr. – 1921 6th Avenue – Watervliet, New York - Mr. Fularo asked the following questions?

- 1.) What will the effect of traffic be at the intersection of 6th Avenue and 19th Street?
- 2.) Will there be a need for a “LEFT TURN ONLY LANE” for the east bound traffic at 6th Avenue.
- 3.) Will it be necessary that a traffic signal be placed at the intersection of 5th Avenue and 19th Street with a “LEFT TURN ONLY” signal for eastbound traffic?
- 4.) If any of these situations do occur who will be responsible to pay for these changes?
- 5.) Since most of the businesses along 19th Street have restrictions regarding hours of operation, will the new store be 24 hours?
- 6.) What will the parking restrictions be on 6th Avenue since some of the tax paying residences only have on street parking and at least two have HANDICAP PARKING PERMITS?
- 7.) Since we have a severe problem with the pavement on 6th Avenue I can only imagine the additional deterioration to the existing road surface on both 5th and 6th Avenues.
- 8.) Will there be restrictions of the hours worked both during demolition and construction since this is primarily a residence area.
- 9.) Will there be parking restrictions for the workers involved in the demolition and construction phase?
- 10.) If and when demolition does occur who will get the salvage value of the copper roof?

Eileen Anderson – 5 Ball Place – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Anderson stated that citizens for St. Patrick’s are not against the sale of St. Patrick’s Church. Ms. Anderson noted that they are against the possibility of a wrecking ball taking down this structure. It is hard for her to believe that all the parishioners of Immaculate Heart of Mary are willing to see the demolition of this beautiful structure. Everyone they have spoken to in Watervliet along with neighboring cities and towns can’t believe that our elected officials, Mayor Manning, Councilwoman Fogarty and Councilman Foglia would allow this to happen. People outside the City appreciate this landmark, it can be seen for miles around. The existing buildings in New York State are our greatest resource. The environment is coming to the forefront. All municipalities are into landfill avoidance. The City Council is proud of the solar energy panels recently installed on some of the City owned buildings. Being environmentally friendly you are too commended for this. The demolition is not environmentally friendly. Ms. Anderson is also surprised that the Golub Corporation, they pride themselves on being friendly and community minded. You are the cause of animosity, there will be a lot of hard feeling. Many people have expressed their disgust regarding this proposal, vowing never to set foot in another Price Chopper. Members of her family have been faithful customers. In a recent local survey Shop Rite and Hannaford ranked higher than Price Chopper. Ms. Anderson does not see this action helping their ratings. They still feel it would be much better if they refurbish the current Price Chopper site.

No hard feelings, no disrupting market life for local residents, not losing your faithful customers, no negative on local small business people along with City officials called the business card of 19th Street. There will be a lot more empty stores along that corridor. Where in any community do you know a local government allowing a supermarket in the middle of a residential neighborhood? They are all on the outskirts of the City or Town like the current Price Chopper. Ms. Anderson hopes that sound minds will prevail and that a buyer will be found that will not demolish this beautiful building modeled after another beautiful church Our Lady of Lourdes in France.

Lorraine Alund – 2127 4th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Alund explained that the back of her house faces 5th Avenue. Her kitchen on the lower level and bedroom and bath on the upper level. After seeing the presentation tonight, she has been in the house for 77 years, her family has been in this house since 1880. Ms. Alund does not know how she can continue to live with a parking lot, lights & trucks with no privacy at all. Ms. Alund is deeply concerned as to where she will park if she has to park on the back street. Ms. Alund is very concerned about her own quality of life. A lot people here are not concerned because they simply do not live here. What would I get for my house if I were to move to get a better quality of life? Ms. Alund hopes someone will consider those who live in that perimeter.

Christine Bulmer – 609 25th Street – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Bulmer stated that she is speaking without the benefit of well-paid communications experts. Most of the people here do not have paid lawyers or paid consultants. Ms. Bulmer does have concerns that a plan to level a historic building for a Price Chopper is not in the best interest of the community. The church of St. Patrick is in the heart of our community, historically, geographically and for many spiritually. Why would Mr. Golub want this building? No matter how many experts are involved the bottom line is for a corporation to make money. The bottom line for the diocese is to sell the property and make money for the church. The bottom line for the City is to get that property on the tax role to make money for the City. Developers, Lawyers, Communications People will make a lot of money throughout this lengthy process. When all of this is over and the entire well paid players walk away. The citizens of Watervliet will bear the long term result of the fiasco. Members of Immaculate Heart of Mary should personally reflect on the impact your efforts will have on someone else's neighborhood. How many of you good people would choose this for your own front or backyard. You will hear the noise, will the value of your property be impacted by the demolition, increased truck traffic, and will your aging parents continue to sit on their porches on hot summer nights. We have an existing heritage site in need of tender loving care. It could and should play a key role in the educational, historical and commercial ventures of this community. The center of a neighborhood, the heart of the City. Why would we sacrifice that integrity by replacing it with a Price Chopper? St. Patrick's is a testimony to the character of the men and women who put Watervliet on the map over 100 years ago. Ms. Bulmer asked the Council what will your legacy be? I would ask Mr. Nigro and Mr. Golub and Bishop Hubbard that exact question. They don't have to worry because they do not live in Watervliet.

Angela M. Mastan – 1816 3rd Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Mastan stated that she has spent 37 of her 40 years here in the City of Watervliet. Ms. Mastan did some research on the Price Chopper website and in 1933 the Central Market was founded which is the current Price Chopper. They are part of Watervliet’s history. Ms. Mastan finds it hard to believe that Mr. Golub would want to put a Price Chopper in a site that has bigger history before his grandparents came over. Ms. Mastan noted that you feel the feelings that we have in a Times Union article. Ms. Mastan stated that she was not asked if she wanted a tailored/high efficiency Price Chopper like the article stated. There are 71 new price Choppers in NYS, 27% of them are within 10 miles of zip code 12189, 19 Price Choppers are within 10 miles of Watervliet, 8 Price Choppers are within 5 miles and 3 price Choppers are within 3 miles. Ms. Mastan further stated that you want to take down a historic site to put up a super center. All these Price Choppers are on bus lines, taxies, Watervliet/Green Island transit. There is another solution why wouldn’t you try and help preserve and restore this structure. “BE A LEADER, NOT ANOTHER PRICE CHOPPER”.

Mary Collett – 321 Boght Road – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Collett wanted to mention that the mailing she received from Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish that one of the statements is that is a difficult and painful decision to make. Ms. Collett completely agrees. Another one of the mailings called the NIGRO Company as well regarded within the community, within the state. Ms. Collett feels the NIGRO Company has a history of disrespecting historic sites like the one we are speaking of tonight. They disregard neighborhoods and communities across the Capital Region. Ms. Collett has heard several examples from Rensselaer County as well as Albany County. Ms. Collett has heard the slash and burn mentality of Mr. Nigro, it’s deplorable. The Business Journal stated once they get passed the emotional issue meaning the demolition of the church, once over the emotional issue most will be rational. Ms. Collett noted that she is being rational and her rationality dictates that this is wrong. She stands here and opposes the NIGRO Companies proposal. Ms. Collett hoped it was not the Golub family behind this proposal. She loves the Latham Price Chopper and the looks of the building. Ms. Collett wishes that it was not on 19th Street for the change. Ms. Collett would hate to leave her bank that she has been a customer of since 1975 to go to the new shiny penny on 19th Street. The Community will be negatively affected. Ms. Collett has been a devoted Price Chopper customer but right now good bye advantage card hello Hannaford.

Antoinette Delduce – 1806 6th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Delduce has lived in the City of Watervliet in the vicinity of the proposed Price Chopper for all her life. Ms. Delduce is 73 years old. Ms. Delduce has been a part and parcel of that church since she was 5 years old. Ms. Delduce looks at the building and the architectural splendor which much has already been removed. It is not that they feel the church has the right to sell the building. Ms. Delduce stated that the Citizens for St. Patrick’s are the integrity of the neighborhood. They are concerned about the impact of the people who surround those buildings. They are concerned about the businesses which still exist such as the Watervliet pharmacy, Bait Shop and the Floral Shop (as examples).

They are concerned about those businesses who have struggled to stay where they are to meet the community needs. They are concerned about people who are living on 5th Avenue and 6th Avenue and the people on the north side of 23rd Street. There will be large trucks traversing their streets along with the impact of daily living along with the structures people live in. The City Council needs to consider the citizens as a whole. Ms. Delduce has much adoration for the Golub family as she has known Neil & Jane Golub since the 1960's. Ms. Delduce knows how wonderful they have been to communities as a whole but this is very sacrilegious to do this. They need find a better place or do a better this with this property. Ms. Delduce is very sure that the members of the City Council are really concerned about the welfare of this entire community or they wouldn't hold the positions they do. Ms. Delduce asked please to do the right thing and restore this building.

Marion Fotache – 1554 3rd Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Fotache is happy to see that the Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish in a recent letter acknowledged the beauty and historical value of St. Patrick's Church. Twelve years ago a copper roof was installed at this location to the tune of one million dollars at St. Patrick's Church. This roof was to last one hundred years. The windows which allowed for ventilation were all restored. In addition to that the church had \$750,000.00 raised to restore the rest of the stained glass windows. The former Pastor was a tremendous administrator and organizer. Now, would the diocese have approved those expenditures if the building were falling apart? Ms. Fotache does not think so. Ms. Fotache understands that the building has deteriorated is that because of neglect. Ms. Fotache remembers going by in a rain storm and watching a waterfall coming down from one of the drains. The drain was obviously backed up and needed to be cleaned. That may account for some of the deterioration of the brick along the roof line. Ms. Fotache stated that this is a legacy left to City residents by canal workers, poor people who struggled that loved their church and they were inspired by Fr. Sheehan who was called a builder. They loved the idea of having this beautiful church, now I understand it is being stripped and things are being shipped all over.

Charlene Akullian – 813 24th Street – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Akullian stated that her feelings have already been beautifully expressed by others tonight. This is an issue which involves our surrounding community. This is a building which can be seen for miles around. It is a landmark for our community. Without this structure we will be just another ordinary little town. Please keep this in mind, she is constantly looking for the white knight out there who will come in and preserve the church and bring an alternative to this proposal. Ms. Akullian is hoping that the proposal will be withdrawn after hearing the feelings of the people tonight.

Ralph Vartigan – 24 Meadow Rd. – Troy, New York – Mr. Vartigan stated he is a resident of North Greenbush. Mr. Vartigan was born and raised here in Watervliet on 8th Avenue and 24th Street. Mr. Vartigan is a graduate of the Class of 1944 at Watervliet High School. Mr. Vartigan has seen a lot in changes in this fine City. It is very difficult for him to think about an historic building like St. Patrick's being demolished. Mr. Vartigan has worked all his life in church. He reminded that St. Peters Armenian Church on the hill some six years ago his parish of 140 families voted to add to the current church building a new office for the priest, conference room and secretary's room. The cost was over \$700,000.00. The church bulletin last Sunday indicated that the bank mortgage on the \$700,000.00 in now over \$30,000.00. How can a small congregation come up with that kind of money? Here Mr. Vartigan wants to clear your conscience a little bit. What were you thinking when you saw the crumbling of the church, what actions did you take. Mr. Vartigan asked that Price Chopper to come up with a viable plan. If there is leadership within the group and change the minds of Price Chopper.

Peggy Germano – 1124 7th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Germano stated that she is a member of the church Finance Committee and a member of the Watervliet Historical Society and she serves on the City's Economic Development Committee for Catholic Charity. Ms. Germano looks at this proposal in many different ways. This is a very emotional topic in many different ways. There isn't a soul in the room who wants to see St. Patrick's taken down. This is not something we want to happen. We need to be realistic about this issue. I have been on the Finance Committee for years. We have been looking at this. If people had continued to go to church the way they used to many years ago this would not be in the condition it is in. We had six catholic churches all of which were full each week. Ms. Germano wonders how many people in this room are from Watervliet, how many people went to church. Ms. Germano noted that millions of dollars are needed to place this building back into a safe condition. There were two separate engineers who did a report on this building. Ms. Germano liked the presentation tonight and felt that this would be a good fit for 19th Street. Ms. Germano worked for over 36 years in the Leo O'Brien Building and right outside her window was St. Joseph's Church. Some 35 years ago people thought they could save the church and keep it going. People tried to make this building into many different uses. It all failed, for the last few years all she could see was pigeons flying in to the building and she does not want to see that with St. Patrick's.

Rich Peters – 1221 8th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Peters stated that he has been a resident of the City of Watervliet all of his life. Mr. Peters discussed Sacred Heart of Mary Parish which he was a member of all his life. Was Mr. Peters mad about the closing of the church, YES he was. Now, he sees the new Immaculate Heart of Mary Church fantastic new church. Mr. Peters noted that there is no St. Patrick's Church, no Sacred Heart of Mary Church. Mr. Peter said that there is one thing nobody is addressing if somehow you can save this building what happens to the school right behind it. Mr. Peters taught religious education back there in the 1990's. The ceilings were falling down back then. If we save the church what happens to that building. Who is going to have to demolish that building, it is getting very close to that time right now. Mr. Peters hasn't heard anything about the existing property other than saving the church. Who is going to pay for the school building if you save the church? No one seems to be addressing that issue. It is going to cost thousands of dollars to demolish this building. Saving the church is great, but what about the rest of the property, what is going to happen to it. Mr. Peters wants to thank Golub Corporation for their presentation tonight.

Carol Rohloff, CSJ, 37 James Street – Green Island, New York – Ms. Rohloff stated that she received her early sacraments from St. Josephs in Green Island. The Sisters of St. Joseph taught in Green Island, they taught in St. Brigid's School. There are many religious entities which taught in Watervliet that had a major impact. The Sisters of Mercy who were for many years at St. Patrick's, Sr. Geraldine was the last Principle. Ms. Rohloff knows that our community came into NYS in 1858. We predate Price Chopper, we predate the Syracuse Diocese. In 1858 in Oswego it was all one diocese. In 1861 we came into Cohoes and Troy, NY. We taught the immigrant communities, they are all the people who built these structures. It was heart breaking not only for the people of St. Patrick's but for all the other communities including the Immaculate Conception who saw a restructuring of their physical building. Ms. Rohloff was personally interviewed in 2003 in the Price Chopper building right down the street. They wanted to know about the proposal about uniting all the parishes. Ms. Rohloff stated that the buildings are not important, it's the people who are important, and everyone has to give a little. If you look around who is interested. Look at the grey hair in this room, it is the senior citizens that if they have an opportunity to be able to walk to Price Chopper and have everything available to them, I say go for it. He (Golub) is one who said they are steam rolling you. If the people came out with the thousands/millions he would walk away.

Jean Krokenberger – 626 23rd Street – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Krokenberger explained that she feels bad for the parishioners of St. Patrick's. Ms. Krokenberger is not a member of St. Patrick's and never was. Ms. Krokenberger is concerned about the community and with our elected officials have chosen to do and with Price Chopper coming into the area. This will ruin my life especially in light of the fact that the City has just doubled her assessment and raised her taxes. Ms. Krokenber feels she will not be able to sell her home for that. In the paper this morning it says we are struggling for America's souls. The City claims it is up to the Catholic Church that sold it, I guess that's true.

The City was very involved in the transaction for the placement of Price Chopper. While middle class we are any many of are senior citizens in Watervliet. Our pay does not go up and neither does our Social Security. We are paying the taxes which have recently gone up with the assessments. We the back bone of our City continue to listen to our elected officials false logic and poor policy in decision making such as this that they continue to get elected and paid – shame on us.

Judy Ploof – 519 23rd Street – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Ploof noted that her home is one of the ones that will be directly impacted by the Price Chopper being across the street. Ms. Ploof has directly across the street right now houses very much like hers, beautiful old home. Ms. Ploof's view will now be the back of a supermarket, that you will hear dumpsters and compressors. As people were speaking she thought about a couple of things. What are the store hours? What are the hours the tractor trailers are going to be allowed to deliver? What Price Chopper is going to do about noise mitigation on the street? Is there a chance of increased crime due to the increased traffic in the neighborhood? Ms. Ploof also having lived in the house for over 18 years and have been a porch sitter for most of those years. She has seen a lot of people who do not realize that 23rd Street is one way, they come up and proceed to turn the wrong way, they are on a one way street. Ms. Ploof feels that with this proposal that a fatality will happen at that corner and she really does not want that around her building. The other thing she sees from being a porch sitter is that all the kids walk up the middle of 6th Avenue and go down to the park. Ms. Ploof is very concerned about the safety of the neighborhood.

John Broderick – 1881 9th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Broderick stated that he has lived here for almost over 40 years. Mr. Broderick is concerned that the Planning Board will make a decision without impact reviews. Mr. Broderick is wondering if the City Council does a coordinated review with the Planning Board/Zoning Board. Mr. Broderick asked if the City has inspected the property in its current condition to determine if there are any violations. Should this property be condemned because it is falling apart? Mr. Broderick feels the City needs to react a lot faster than NIGRO Company can get this all taken care of. On 23rd Street Mr. Broderick would like to see the truck traffic issue addressed which was omitted in the traffic study. On a personal note which Mr. Broderick has experienced on his properties in North Troy, the garbage, who will be responsible to clean that up, will it be Golub, will it Price Chopper, let's face it, it will be the neighbors.

Grace B. Collett – 1917 6th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Collett has a couple of questions. Has the City Council asked the State Historic Preservation Office whether St. Patrick's is eligible for listing on the State or National Registry of Historic places? What if any answer was given and if you have inquired, she is curious why. Obviously this evening we have already established it's a historical site and it really unfortunate to see so many people with their fancy stickers on that sat in the pews of St. Patrick's. Ms. Collett also noticed where the church is brand new there is nothing from the other parishes.

Ms. Collett was told before that there was supposed to be anything from the other churches in the new church. Ms. Collett finds it ironic that we all sit in the same pews taken out of St. Patrick's in the new church. Also, a lot of the residents with your stickers on who are here to support the future of St. Patrick's, some of you don't live in the direct vicinity of the church and honestly you didn't have to watch the 12 disciples like many of us did.

Richard Collins – 609 3rd Street – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Collins Explained that his home is approximately 70' from the corner of 23rd Street and 6th Avenue. Mr. Collins does not want to see the three homes on 23rd Street brought down. Mr. Collins standing in his front window the back of a brick building that is really intrusive to the whole area. What you have now on 23rd Street is a residential street. There are no businesses except the old Geno's which is also crumbling. Someone already stated that Price Chopper is a good fit for 19th Street, 23rd Street doesn't need a whole row of houses disappear and be replaced with the back of a brick building. Mr. Collins talked about garbage, trucks coming, hopefully not all hours of the night. Then the increase of foot traffic in the neighborhood, foot traffic which now stops at the bridge. Mr. Collins does not want the foot traffic going thru the City.

Margaret Macri – 2325 4th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Macri stated that she has a husband, a 2 year old, and an eight month old son. The reason why she states this is that both her and her husband both lived outside of Watervliet in Albany. They both decided that they would invest and move into Watervliet this community to raise their children. When they came to look at their home they saw a beautiful 1800's brick building. We saw quiet streets with children running all around, families with strollers walking thru. Ms. Macri looks out her back window and the Little League Park is there. Ms. Macri has two sons and thought I can live in this community that takes do much pride in their Little League. The kids come down the street with no problems, in groups laughing. They go down to the park and they play. If this Price Chopper is built in this neighborhood the children will not be able to do this. Ms. Macri will not want to let her children out of the house due to being afraid of the potential traffic coming down the road. Ms. Macri knows that it is zoned residential right now. The City has these zoning regulations for a reason. Ms. Macri understands that Price Chopper has out grown its space. If they come into her neighborhood she will have the garbage and cart problem. The wheel lock system does not work, she has seen it. Tractor trailers with diesel engines coming down the street. Lack of future planning on their part does not mean her future plans, her neighborhood and her investment has to sacrifice for theirs.

Tom Hanley – 27 Valley View Avenue – Latham, New York – Mr. Hanley started out by saying that he is not a Watervliet resident. Mr. Hanley noted that his family came to Watervliet in 1847 and most of them have been here since then. Mr. Hanley is the archivist for the church. Mr. Hanley said to Grace that would love to be able to show her all the artifacts that is still in existence. Mr. Hanley noted that the entire parish records from the six parishes are housed at Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish. Anyone from 1840 to this date who did any of the catholic sacraments they have the records of, this has not changed. Mr. Hanley also stated that he loves St. Patrick's too, he went to St. Patrick's School from K thru 8 and graduated in 1960. He doesn't want to see St. Patrick's demolished just because someone does not come forward with a realistic offer. Then there is the school in the back which someone can't even go into to.

Peter Rogers – 1913 6th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Rogers comment was he has a 5 month old child that he doesn't think he would want to stay with a supermarket right there. He thinks that he would leave the area if something like this is built. Mr. Rogers has not heard from anyone as to what the five offers were that the church was given and whether they included changing the Zoning Code. The other proposals submitted to the church did they include building homes or apartments which is a possible compromise. You can't have your children walking around a large supermarket as the one which is being proposed in this type of neighborhood. Changing the zoning does not change the neighborhood.

John Kenney – 1900 12th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Kenney stated that he was a business person in Watervliet for over 47 years. Mr. Kenney never feared competition when he owned the flower shop. Mr. Kenney feels that it benefits us to educate the public for quality and craftsmanship. Mr. Kenney knows that there is a certain amount of people who will go to a large box store to purchase to buy their flowers. Mr. Kenney talked about that slanderous remark about people coming over from Troy. Mr. Kenney is a Christian and is not a bigot in any way. In 47 years of running a business he didn't care what color you were. As long as the money was green. Mr. Kenney is a business person and treats everyone the same until he is treated differently. Mr. Kenney feels if we do not implode that building it will implode itself. Mr. Kenney concluded by saying you are in dreamland, you will never find someone with that deep of pockets to maintain that property.

Richard Cunningham – President of Passonno Paints – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Cunningham stated that all of you can be very proud of how respectful of how you all have been to each other. Mr. Cunningham lives in the City of Troy but spent his entire life in the City of Watervliet. Mr. Cunningham can tell the feeling over the years as he has watched when he has many customers within a couple miles of the factory. Mr. Cunningham stated that made in Troy is OK, made in NYS is OK but made in Watervliet is even better. Mr. Cunningham noted that as he looks throughout the entire country we have to find economic engines to pull us forward. We have gone sideways economically in many ways. Mr. Cunningham encourages that you keep looking for economic engines to pull you forward and lift you up.

Phil Quandt – 403 23rd Street – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Quandt stated that he looks out his window and he sees a beautiful church. Mr. Quandt then noted let's forget about the church, let's take a look at the impact, trucks, carts, kids they don't mix in addition to garbage all over the streets. Mr. Quandt said take a look at Price Chopper now he can't take care of his building and you want to build a new building. Mr. Quandt also stated fix the old building or rebuild the old building. Don't put a price Chopper in my front door. I don't want it there. Mr. Quandt will paint his home pink if you put this building in there.

Helen Letko – 1875 9th Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Letko stated that by looking at her you can see she does not drive at night so this is the first meeting she has been to. Ms. Letko's family has been living in the same house for over 90 years. Ms. Letko stated her question was on Channel 17 Mayor Manning said we were able to do so many things in Watervliet. You have been able to get so many grants, who wrote up the grants. All of you folks who want to save our City have any of you try to get anybody to write a grant or grants. Ms. Letko asked a question to the Finance gentleman, how much is going to save each homeowner with his additional money from Golub Corporation. How many of you could spare from \$10 - \$25 if we could get ahold of a specialist who writes grants so that those grants could be used to preserve St. Patrick's.

Ruth Clemens – 1217 Spring Avenue – Wynantskill, New York – Ms. Clemens is said about the thought of losing St. Patrick's Church, she did teach there alongside the Sisters of Mercy in 1965 – 1966. Ms. Clemens found this to be a very good community. Ms. Clemens is very fond of preserving this historic building. This is just a majestic building and it is very heart breaking to think it may be gone. She is glad to see that a an emphasis that Golub Corporation is saving the 200 year old trees on 19th Street. Ms. Clemens conclude by noting that she agrees with Mr. Vartigan if there is no one else to step forward to preserve this church and if anyone else fails to support this, you can't count on the dwindling senior citizens to support this, then Price Chopper would be a good client.

There being no further comment, Mayor Manning closed the Public Comment Period.

A motion was made and seconded to adjourn. The meeting was adjourned at 9:10 P.M.

Respectfully Submitted,

Bruce A. Hidley
City Clerk and Clerk to the Council