

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF WATERVLIET  
THURSDAY, AUGUST 23, 2012 AT 7:00 P.M.**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Michael P. Manning at 7:00 P.M.

Roll call showed that Mayor Michael P. Manning, Councilwoman Ellen R. Fogarty and Councilman Nicholas W. Foglia were present.

Also present from City Administration were: Mark Gleason; General Manager, Bruce A. Hidley, City Clerk and Clerk to the Council, Robert A. Fahr, Director of Finance and Police Chief Ron Boisvert.

A motion was made and seconded to dispense with and accept the minutes from the previous City Council Meeting.

**REPORT OF OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES**

**ITEM #1** – Mark Gleason, General Manager informed the Council that the Department of Recreation Summer Program has come to an end. The annual pool party for our residents was held this past Monday. The City had to close the pool earlier than was hoped this year due to a lack of Lifeguards. A majority of the City's Lifeguards are college students who left for college this weekend. The City did not have enough Lifeguards to keep the pool open. The City is currently trying to recruit Lifeguards. Mr. Gleason requested that anyone who may be interested in working as a Lifeguard or may know someone who is interested to please contact his office. Mr. Gleason noted that the City had two successful Recreation Programs this summer which were the men's and women's basketball leagues. The men's league added 4 new teams with over 100 participants. The women's league (new this year) had 4 teams with over 45 participants. Mr. Gleason thanked Josh Spratt and Matt Eithier who were the driving force behind the leagues. Mr. Gleason stated that during the summer of 2013 the City anticipates to add more teams to the women's basketball league as well as to start an over 40 year old basketball league. The next program the Department of Recreation will host is the Arsenal City Run on Friday, September 21, 2012.

**ITEM #2** – Mark Gleason, General Manager informed the Council that on Thursday, July 19, 2012 he attended the second meeting of the Capital Region Sustainability Plan (Solid Waste Technical Committee). At the meeting Ken Gallagher of Clough Harbour Associates presented a draft summary of goals. These goals were drafted at the first meeting of the Solid Waste Technical Committee. They are the following:

- Develop new systems to recycle and/or recover energy from food waste and other organic materials in the existing solid waste stream (Anaerobic Digestion).
- Improving existing recycling programs more effectively diverting designated recyclables and by increasing the number of materials that are currently designated for recycling (Single Stream Recycling)
- Develop material management strategies on both the regional and local levels that encourage local manufacturing that utilizes regionally recycled materials and that encourages municipalities, businesses, institutions and local non-profits to buy local products including recycled products (Encourage purchasing locally recycled materials).

The Capital Regional Sustainability Plan will lay the foundation for how funding is allocated for the operation of projects throughout the state, as well as increase the region's opportunities for other state and federal funds. The Solid Waste Technical Committee plan mirrors the City's plan for organic waste and recycling. Many of the ideas that the technical committee are working on and will forward to the Executive Committee for adoption are based on our WOW & Recycling Programs. The plan must be in place by December 1, 2012. Mr. Gleason will keep the Council updated of the programs the City will be implementing.

### **OLD BUSINESS**

**ITEM #1** - Mr. Gleason addressed a resident concern as to work at the City's Service Reservoir on Gloria Drive in Latham, NY. The electrical wire in question was on City property and not installed correctly (the wire was not grounded). The electrical wire was displaced during the Service Reservoir Reconstruction Project that was mandated by DEC. The electrical line was on City property and not properly installed. The City will not take on the liability of replacing the line. The mound of topsoil in question is to be used in another area of the Service reservoir. The City was waiting for DEC approval for placement of the topsoil. The NYSDEC has approved the placement and the topsoil will be moved soon.

**PUBLIC HEARING** – A Public Hearing regarding those persons who wish to heard in reference to the City of Watervliet acting as Lead Agency in the Environmental Review of the Comprehensive Capital Grant Program for the Watervliet Housing Authority. Mayor Manning explained that the City of Watervliet is acting as the Lead Agency for the SEQR process for the Watervliet Housing Authority for a grant that the Housing Authority gets for rehabilitation projects. Yorden Huban, Corporation Counsel noted that Charles Patricelli, Executive Director of the Housing Authority notifies the City each year that the Housing Authority is required to submit projects for the coming year. One of the requirements is to have Public Hearing for public comment. Mr. Huban further explained that later in the Business portion of the City Council Meeting a Resolution will be read to authorize Mayor Manning to execute the Environmental Assessment Form to determine if there is any significant impact.

Mark Gleason, General Manager explained that the Housing Authority is planning on building a handicap accessible laundry room. Mr. Gleason noted that the Housing Authority does a great job and is never cited for any environmental issues.

Mayor Manning opened the Public Hearing for comment, there being no comment Mayor Manning closed the Public Hearing.

Bruce A. Hidley, City Clerk and Clerk to the Council explained that the 2<sup>nd</sup> Public hearing will be held after the Appropriations and Accounting portion of the Agenda.

**ORDINANCE NO. 1885 – SECOND READING** - An Ordinance of the City of Watervliet, New York, providing that the Code of Ordinances of the City of Watervliet, Article II of Chapter 209, Section 209-4(A) (7) of the Code of the City of Watervliet be amended to read as follows, T/Sgt. Peter J. Dalessandro Veterans Memorial Park, Sixteenth Street and Second Avenue and further amends Article III, Section 209-6(G) is amended to read as follows, T/Sgt. Peter J. Dalessandro Veterans Memorial Park, Sixteenth Street and Second Avenue. Before voting Mayor Manning explained that this is strictly changing the Code of Ordinance to change the name of the park. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Ordinance was approved and adopted.

**RESOLUTION NO. 8856** – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes the renaming of Veterans Memorial Park to the T/Sgt. Peter J. Dalessandro Veterans Memorial Park and further authorizes Mayor Michael P. Manning to execute any documents to consummate the renaming of such park. Mayor Manning explained that this is a sister resolution to the Ordinance just read and approved to take care of any the formal applications which may need to be done. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

**RESOLUTION NO. 8861** – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby approves and authorizes Mayor Michael P. Manning to execute a Special Use and Hold Harmless Agreement between the City of Watervliet and the Town of Colonie for the use of the Town of Colonie Police Range and Training facility. Before voting Mayor Manning explained that this is a use agreement to use the Town of Colonie firing range. Upon motion of Councilwoman Fogarty, seconded by Councilman Foglia, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

**RESOLUTION NO. 8862** – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes Mayor Michael P. Manning to complete and sign as required the determination of significance confirming the Negative Declaration under the Watervliet Housing Authority Capital Fund Project for 2012. Before voting Yorden Huban, Corporation Counsel explained that this is the companion Resolution that the City Council will make a determination as to whether or not the project will or will not result in a significant adverse environmental impact. If not the Resolution authorizes Mayor Manning to execute the second part of the short environmental assessment form and any other document in connection with this. Mayor Manning there were no comments during the Public Comment period. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

#### **APPROPRIATIONS AND ACCOUNTING**

**RESOLUTION NO. 8863** – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes the transfer of \$27,000.00 from the Police Payroll Account to the Police Special Wages Account for the months of June and July 2012. Before voting Mayor Manning explained that this is a budget neutral wages transfer due to employees out on Workers Compensation. Upon motion of Councilwoman Fogarty, seconded by Councilman Foglia, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

**RESOLUTION NO. 8864** – The Council of the City of Watervliet hereby authorizes the transfer of \$21,000.00 from the Fire Payroll Account to the Fire Special Wages Account for the months of June and July 2012. Mayor Manning explained that this is a budget neutral transfer the same as the last Resolution. Upon motion of Councilman Foglia, seconded by Councilwoman Fogarty, this Resolution was approved and adopted.

Robert A. Fahr, Director of Finance explained to the Council that he is setting up for the Budgetary Workshops for the 2013 budget cycle. Mr. Fahr will keep the Council posted as to what departments will have their budget workshops on what nights. These budget workshops will be held at 6:00 P.M. prior to the City Council Meeting. Mayor Manning noted that the Budget Workshops are open to the public.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

Mayor Manning asked if anyone would like to make a public comment on something other than the Public Hearing issue. There being no comment Mayor Manning closed the Public Comment Period.

### **OLD BUSINESS – CONTINUED**

Mayor Manning explained that after the reading notice of the Public Hearing that he would call upon Nigro Companies to begin their presentation then the Public Hearing for the public.

**PUBLIC HEARING** – A Public Hearing regarding those persons who wish to be heard in reference to the Supplemental Project Report and response to City Council issues dated August 2012 and the pending rezoning classification of the properties located on City block bounded by 19<sup>th</sup> Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue in the City of Watervliet from R-3 Residential to B-1 Business District.

Mayor Manning noted that the Public Hearing is now open and that the presentation would start first.

Robert Sweeney an attorney for Nigro Companies the developer for the 19<sup>th</sup> Street, St. Patrick's Church property project. Mr. Sweeney explained that he is here again to engage in a Public Hearing and Public Comment on the next step of the process. The City Council presented Nigro Companies with a series of questions exactly nine (9) of them with many subparts to the questions about a month ago. Mr. Sweeney noted that his firm has put together a response to the questions and has been filed in the record for some time. Just to bring you back a little bit in April Nigro filed a project application for this project which is the construction of a 40,200 square foot Price Chopper neighborhood grocery store on the St. Patrick's Church site. The original application contained site plans, site renderings and traffic reports along with a series of relevant information for the development of the project. In the months following Nigro Companies were at the City Council and Planning Board Meetings many times. There was a Public Hearing and a lot in input from the public and from the City consultants. That lead to the series of nine questions that Nigro Companies was asked to address. Several weeks ago Nigro Companies filed a supplemental project report in response to City Council issues, addressing in sequence each of the nine issues raised. Additionally, there is a supplemental traffic report, a visual impact study, a sound study all the relevant information to support this application and to respond to the Public Comment that Nigro Companies have heard since the start of this process. Mr. Sweeney now turned the program over to the engineer. You will find in the supplemental project report a revised site plan updating all on the changes. You will also see a lot of site renderings so you can visualize what these changes will do to the project. You will recognize both the responsiveness of both Price Chopper and Nigro Companies to the issues brought to their attention. What you will see is the 19<sup>th</sup> Street streetscape and what it will look like. Two retail buildings on 19<sup>th</sup> Street to create a continuous street scape. You will see lot more greenspace on the site and a lot of landscaping to make it more aesthetically more pleasing. That will provide increased buffers around the residential neighbors to protect their properties and give it a better look for their point of view.

You will see some measures and have our traffic engineer tell you about some additional improved traffic measures that will mitigate any potential for traffic improvement they expect. The initial traffic report and all but one intersection did very favorably. Nigro has new mitigation measures for 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue that will further increase traffic flows on that intersection. There are some noise measures, storm water measures they will talk about. All in response to comments from the consultants and the public. Nigro will also do a brief piece on the enhanced architecture to the building. A lot of improvements to make them sit into a residential neighborhood. Nigro will take you thru the significant changes to the site plan so you can recognize them from what you have seen and commented on over the first three or four months of the application.

Greg Irsprung, I'm a professional Engineer from Bergman Associates. First, with regard to land use we did modify the street scape along 19<sup>th</sup> Street. We moved the building we had here up closer to 19<sup>th</sup> Street and then added a second building. We feel this is in keeping with the fabric of 19<sup>th</sup> Street and is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. This is an artist rendering of what the view of 19<sup>th</sup> Street would look like. This would be the building on the corner of 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and this would be the corner of 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. You can see it is more consistent with the City Street and along 19<sup>th</sup> Street. With regard to the site layout we made a number of changes here. The building has been shifted 20 feet from the curb line along 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. That allowed Nigro to increase the landscape on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. They added street trees along 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue to make this more pedestrian friendly and also to provide a buffer to the building. Again along 19<sup>th</sup> Street they added positive green space to make that area more aesthetically pleasing and make a nice entrance to the Price Chopper. Additionally, the parking lot size has been reduced from 169 spaces to 146 spaces. This has been significantly reduced. These are some images of the boards up front from 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. This is a view from the corner of 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue looking at the back of the building. You can see the landscaping has been increased significantly. This is another view of the back of the building along 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. You can see some of the architectural improvements that have been made. With regards to the storm water management that design of that has been modified, we are providing storm water detention so there will be no increase in storm water runoff from the site from which currently exists. They will provide water quality treatment and that storm water detention prior to discharge to the dry river sewer which is really were the storm water really goes right now. All of the storm water will be in compliance with NYSDEC and City of Watervliet requirements. With regard to the noise a study was done in June this year. We took readings along 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 23<sup>rd</sup> Street (existing noise levels). With the screen wall provided on the back of the building and over by the loading dock area. They found there would be no significant impact with regards to noise on the neighbors. With regard to the rooftop units, the exhaust will be directed back to the parking lot so it won't be directed to the neighborhood. They will also be provided with screen walls around the rooftop units. The screen walls on the back of the building are 20' high and at the loading dock area.

Wendy Holzberger – Professional Engineer with Creighton/Manning Engineering. Just to go over the two traffic related changes to the site plan are related to some modifications at the northern site access on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue to allow for trucks to come in and turn around on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 19<sup>th</sup> Street as the access point. The second change they are recommending to put a right turn lane on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue at this intersection with 19<sup>th</sup> Street. As noted we had picked up an additional supplemental traffic evaluation in July of this year that went into the supplemental report. The changes that were different from the first report included updating the analysis due to change of the out parcel with the second out parcel the 5,700 square feet. Those numbers were modified and the analysis numbers are included in that report and did not show any changes in the level of service that they had presented prior. They also did a more detailed evaluation of the on street parking on 5<sup>th</sup> Ave., 6<sup>th</sup> Ave. and 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. They went out several different days including weekends and weekdays and different times of days. Additionally, the findings were documented along with what parking was available, what parking was utilized and made a determination based on the spots that would be lost due to the new driveway location. There would be adequate parking maintained on the side roads. There is also documentation presented they had presented in a previous meeting that changes the modification. In the original report they had recommended that the truck access thru 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. Due to a lot of comments by the City and the residents we did modify that to change the access to in from 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and stay off of 23<sup>rd</sup> Street which we do not need to get any weight restrictions lifted. That is also included and documented. Also the garbage pickups will remain on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street as we have presented before. The smaller delivery trucks are now alongside 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue instead of the back of the back of the building on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street as presented in the initial report. One other thing that is included in that report is we had several comments on trip generation that they used for the projections for this facility for this report. What they presented was a worse case analysis using the Institute of Transportation Engineers numbers which does not account for the urban nature and the increased pedestrians in this type of environment. To make sure that the numbers for mitigation are appropriate we did present the worst case which has numbers approximately 40% higher than the initial report. Another thing I had noted before is construction of the right turn lane on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a mitigation measure. That was based on assessment of different mitigation measures that we had looked at, additional signals, changing signals and it was determined that the right turn lane is the best option for that. That is also documented in the report.

Mr. Sweeney introduced Steve Duffey an architect with Price Chopper who will take you through some of the changes to the building. Mr. Duffey wanted to make one note that a comment was made about the noise study they performed. That was based not only on readings that are performed on site in terms of background levels but it was based on actual readings from a very similar store in terms of the rooftop mechanical configuration. The architectural enhancements we made since you received comments. The building architectural place similar detailing to the community with respect to appearance, we are articulating the building with the brick peers. That theme is also found around the site in the fence area. In addition they have a black shingled roof which they found in the community. We have added additional embellishments to the cornices and we have a water table around the entire building as well as adding additional windows throughout the building. What that means we are adding as much natural light in the building as possible. A lot of the windows will be real windows clear natural lighting. The last slide will show no spillage of light off of the property. The light pole throughout the project is 20' high in atypical development light poles are 30' to 40' high. We kept them low to maintain and minimize the glare for property. The effect is you won't have any kind of halo glow offsite. Also, the overall level of lighting throughout the project is going to be no different and consistent with what you see within the City.

Mr. Sweeney wanted to make a couple of quick comments directly responsive to some of the comments made to the applicant thus far in the process. What you are looking at the lower slide is the 23<sup>rd</sup> Street view of the Price Chopper store. This is actually the back of the store and I think you will recognize the effort and attention it's gone into making this neighborhood friendly and the changes that have been made to do this. The building has been pushed forward as far as it can go right up to the edge of the Dry River Sewer. There is 20' from the curb line you can see the landscaping there. That is actually the back of the grocery store building. It is all behind a sound wall. The one open space is a sliding door and anything that has to come and go out of that will come thru the sliding door that will close. Anyone on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street will have no visibility of the usual back of a grocery store. I think it is fair to say that you never have seen the back of a grocery store that looks like that and maybe you won't again. But it does demonstrate the significant effort and commitment that the applicant has made to make this store right for the neighborhood and to respond to your comments. One last thing, the property will be owned by Nigro Companies all of this will be maintained by Nigro Companies, the landscaping and site exterior.

Angela Mastan – 1816 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Mastan stated that St. Patrick's future and integrity and part of our neighborhood is at stake. Not the people's party's reputation that are involved, whose responsibility is St. Patrick's and it is unfortunate that is over our City. It isn't all of ours but ultimately Bishop Hubbard and the Albany Diocese is responsible for the monetary upkeep of St. Patrick's not the parishioners of Immaculate Heart of Mary Church and not the taxpayers of the City of Watervliet. How sad it is as of now that the puppet game has been played behind our backs. How sad it is that a priest would encourage the destruction of a catholic church during mass. How sad it is that people in Watervliet who used to talk with each other must now be divided from the incorrect information put out there about the stability of St. Patrick's Church. The City Council has to consider with this project I ask that you seek and volunteer prior to making your decision. Because it is not about being king for a day, it is not about having control, having money, it's about the citizens of Watervliet all past, present and future ones. True Price Chopper has been in our family since 1934, but it was our family members not theirs that put the bricks together at St. Patrick's. I am perceiving a beautiful structure that encompasses Watervliet's history and future.

Janet Null – 297 River Street – Troy, New York – Ms. Null stated that she is President of Artist Architectural Preservation in Troy, New York. I am an architect with 40 years experience repairing and renovating historic structures including master planning and urban design. The analysis at least what is available of the church's condition that I have seen is incredibly vague and misleading. It seems to have been accepted as fact. There has not in fact been an assessment of the condition or the cost of rehabilitating the church that has been compared. Nigros assessment of the impact of demolition is simply disingenuous. I've been in Troy for over 35 years and for someone to say that the skyline of Watervliet would be very little changed by the demolition of this building just makes me think they have lied. St. Patrick's in my expertise may be saved and reused and it should be. Not just because it is historical, around the time St. Patrick's was built a famous architect said the following: Make no small plans, there is no magic, make big plans aim high, hope and think big. Among other things creative thinking that Chicago has one of the greatest waterfronts of any City in the world. In contrast if our immediate area cities like Troy and Albany for example have failed to really compromise on their waterfronts due to a lack of vision. I am afraid that Watervliet is about to join this small thinking and irretrievably squander the potential of St. Patrick's Church and its land. The St. Patrick's site is one the greatest assets the City of Watervliet have in my opinion. It is a landmark and a focal point of the City. The site is large and right in the center of the City. It's really easy to understand why Price Chopper and Nigro are keen on developing the property. What's incomprehensible is that the City does not seem very interested in its potential. Surely you want it to be on the tax rolls and I agree with you. This property is ultimately worth far more to the City financially than the current developer would ever provide you. The St. Patrick's property is ideally suited and situated to be the town square of Watervliet and its large enough to accommodate such a public space and in addition to accommodate commercial, residential development around with the church remaining as the monumental center piece.

Perhaps used as a cultural center or civic center. Please do not proceed with the approach that will squander one of the greatest assets of your City for a private parking lot and building built to last no more than 30 years. Instead please step up and develop real long term vision of the St. Patrick's property. This should be done this can be done and the rewards for Watervliet could be tremendous.

Julie Iannone – 42 Paine Street – Green Island, New York – Ms. Iannone stated that the lady before made some good suggestions, but I don't see anybody paying for them. Price Chopper is the one stepping up to the plate, it is a beautiful church. But it is a church that the catholic parishioners have walked away from. They have the money to fix it but refuse to do so. I think if these are the people looking to help the City of Watervliet GREAT. If they have somebody else out there with the money WONDERFUL.

Pat Falaro – 1921 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Falaro stated I still and will always object to the demolition of St. Patrick's Church. As to the new proposal by the Nigro Corporation shifting stuff how does this impact the Dry River Sewer and what does it do. You say the cost of demolition, asbestos removal makes other use cost prohibitive. How is it they were able to demolish the old Playtex Factory? I'm sure they encountered the same costs. You speak on land use on the 19<sup>th</sup> Street corridor. So far since I have lived there we have lost Maggie's, liquor store, sub shop, Carr's is now closing, a computer store that moved further west and a convenience store. Now you want to propose two new stores on 19<sup>th</sup> Street. Your traffic reports speak of on street parking would not be significantly impacted. What is your definition of significant? There has been no mention of the intersection of 23<sup>rd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>, southbound on 5<sup>th</sup> and northbound are the only Stop Signs. Southbound is hampered by the large residential building on the west side. Now 23<sup>rd</sup> Street is east/west traffic west of 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and eastbound on the west of 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Do you have any ideas of the problems with the increase traffic to that intersection? Has anyone just once thought of the people or the home owners that live around the proposed site? You keep saying everyone wants this, we are a part of everybody and we were never once asked what we wanted. I noticed the school route signs posted on 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and today the speed monitor was placed. In fact this morning I witnessed a woman driving the wrong way down 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. What effect do you think Price Chopper will have on the traffic condition to the City school route? I guess that by keeping St. Patrick's looking like a dump we will be begging for the Price Chopper – Guess Again.

Kathy Judd – 1620 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Judd stated that I respectfully state the following for the record. I feel the zoning at the former St. Patrick's site should remain residential. Price Chopper or any other major market in the middle of our City will be detrimental for the short term and long term with respect to our environment, health, safety and property. Under any circumstance this is not good government planning. This City needs revitalization and will likely never happen if you give the go ahead for building a Price Chopper or any other major supermarket in the middle of Watervliet.

As Mayor and City Council it is your responsibility to act on the people's behalf in regards to environment, health, safety, property and overall wellbeing. An individual was quoted as saying "Seek receives breeds corruption while transparency generates competence" This needs to be shared with the people, I'm interested in knowing what factors you are basing your vote on and how these factors will be weighted. Additionally, I would like to know if the City has contracted for any independent studies or whether you are relying solely on information that has been selected and paid for by those who are requesting the rezoning for financial gain. While assuming the role as Council and Mayor persons separation of church and state must be adhered to. Your stewardship as it relates to your parish and your stewardship as it relates to this City are two totally separate issues. Lastly, as far planning for my own future I need to know what is your vision for Watervliet.

Matt Scheidt – 76 Bassett Street – Albany, New York – Mr. Scheidt explained that he is a registered architect in the State of New York. I have 15 years experience in historic preservation projects. Today I'm speaking on behalf as the roll as the Chairman of the Historic Resources Committee for the Eastern New York State Chapter of Americans of Architects. I think it is clear to everyone that St. Patrick's is both an architectural and cultural landmark in the City of Watervliet. It is also clear its loss would be both irreversible and extremely damaging to the community. I conducted yesterday a binocular survey of the exterior of the building although I have been inside the building I read all the engineers reports that have been done the last few years. It also clear that nothing prevents this building from being successfully reused for a number of different uses. Sure it would be expensive and difficult to find someone to do it. It is also clear that the reports done to date are not geared towards what are the possibilities they are geared to what the problems are. There are numerous examples across the region of churches even large churches that have been successfully adaptively reused and that are either completed or in the process of going into construction. Churches in Great Barrington, Troy, Albany and Schenectady, it is clear it is possible that it can be done. It just takes some kind of imagination. I strongly encourage the owners, developers and the City to set aside time to prepare a serious feasibility study for the after reuse of the building. There is nothing here that can't wait six months or a year while a study is done that looks at not only reusing the existing building but what are the benefits of doing that. What attributes of the building that exists can be retained, it's a fabulous building, and it has a unique architectural expression, even among large parish churches. It runs itself to creative ideas for its use.

Ralph Provenza – 6 Alena Drive – Latham, New York – Mr. Provenza explained that I have been a parishioner of Immaculate Heart of Mary Church for 7 years. I'm a member of the parish Council Planning Committee, Building Committee, coordinate two parish fundraising events, Eucharistic minister an Officer of the Watervliet Knights of Columbus and I was the principal of St. Brigid's School. I want to make it known that I strongly support the re-zoning of St. Patrick's property for two reasons. #1 – Because the Nigro proposal is the only viable proposal that has come forward in the past two years. #2 – Because St. Patrick's property is a financial hardship on the parish directly and indirectly to hundreds of Watervliet parishioners and residents

John Cummings – 1600 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Cummings stated that I have to admit that the proposal, drawings and renderings are beautiful. But all this would fit where the existing Price Chopper is right now. To take this beautiful building, St. Patrick's over a hundred years old. I go by it every day on purpose both ways, I never take any shortcuts. I'm amazed at the beauty of it and the architectural beauty. I have to agree with the architect who spoke a couple people prior to me. That time needs to be taken to fully study this because that building under no circumstances should come down. It would be a disgrace to the City of Watervliet and to the Council and the mayor himself should that building be destroyed.

Jeff Foster – 1201 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Foster stated that I look at the drawing and everything looks great. The only way 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue a block and a half down, we have the baseball park. So we are going to have all this traffic I would say almost on half of it driving down by our baseball park. But then I was thinking this isn't so bad we only had one major team last year. So we are almost done with the baseball park. Maybe next year that can be a Hannaford. But competition is good. I do like the green space idea, I think if they take the green space out and we have a relief of traffic of 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenues. But before you make any decision at all hopefully you do the right thing and you take all the residents that live in that area. Because at the end of the day I can go home, I don't live near this. All the people from Latham and Troy that's fantastic, let them come buy a house across the street because I'm sure they will be for sale. I think what you need to do is get all the residents everybody tell us leave, get all the residents that live around this in here before you make a decision. Hopefully Mayor Manning you better ask. At the end of the day we will be living around this. So get ahold of the people around this and let them make these decisions about the architects or the noise or the this or that. Because we don't live near it. They are going to have to live with that. At least give them consideration of being a part of it. Mayor and two Council people no public meeting no everybody else leave because these are the people that are going to be left with this at the end of the day.

Fr. Edward Deimeke – 695 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Fr. Deimeke explained that he is the Pastor of the Immaculate Heart of Mary Parish in Watervliet and Green Island. Since March of 2010 it has been known that St. Patrick's was closing and that there would be a sale. There have been 4 bids, the most attractive of which was the Nigro Companies. None of this is new. What I do want to state again is that the parish not the diocese bears the burden of maintaining this building and it is costing the parish \$125.00 a day for insurance and utilities, just to maintain the building as it is.

Carol Mahar Jesep – 14 Audrey Rd. – Latham, New York – Ms. Jesep stated that she approaching the time of her life when she is thinking of moving back to Watervliet, now I am reconsidering that idea. It is a shame that you think that this is just a Watervliet problem. This is the most beautiful building you have left. Some people wonder why do people leave Watervliet? Why are there so many empty buildings? “WHY”. In order to attract people back to Watervliet you have to keep things that people would want to come back to Watervliet for. This place could be a cultural center where people from Latham, Troy, and Albany all these places around this area will come and bring in money. It doesn't have to be paid by the church. It doesn't have to be paid by the taxpayers. This could be a place where you could revitalize Watervliet as a community. Keeping St. Patrick's Church this beautiful building the last piece of beauty in all of Watervliet is the only thing to do. There are as many have said before me many creative ideas, many successful creative ideas that have been implemented successfully in Buffalo, Troy and Albany. Why doesn't Watervliet care about the future of this Town? “WHY?” This is very short sighted. It is just a short term thing, in 20 years when this building goes downhill what are you going to have left “NOTHING”. Save St. Patrick's, don't just think about tomorrow. In the great depression St. Patrick's didn't go down, people had no money. In Europe people stopped going to church a long time ago. They didn't tear down buildings in communist countries like Russia, Mexico, they kept their historic building and churches even though no one was going to church. They didn't tear them down, they recognized that architectural beauty is important to the culture of the community. I beg you, don't do this, don't do this. Thank you.

Eileen Anderson – 5 Ball Place – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Anderson stated that St. Patrick's was built in 1890. It was the most important structure north of New York City. It permanently changed the landscape of the Hudson River line. It's very spiritual as well as a tourist attraction. A local newspaper at the turn of the century described the church the best. St. Patrick's Church has the distinction of being the finest church edifice its size this side of New York City. There is no other church in the United States like it. St. Patrick's Church can be seen for many miles and the attention of most strangers is attracted by its height. We don't have strangers traveling by rail or boat now but other than that nothing has changed from that description. Travelers from all over the Capital District have expressed similar sentiments. But now we are not talking about a catholic church that has closed. Now we are talking about a magnificent historic architectural building which is eligible for the National Historic Register of Historic Places. For over 120 years this church has been as anchor of our community. Citizens for St. Patrick's wants to promote positive efforts to develop this historic landmark as a vital center of neighborhood life with a focus on respect for history, heritage, art and quality of neighborhood life for present and future generations. That is why Citizens for St. Patrick's does not approve of the new proposal. This proposal still calls for the demolition of this physical manifestation. A symbol of the ability of men and women to transcend average and create something beautiful. The same passion, tenacity and sense of purpose brought the Irish to greatness in 1890 is with us today.

We are looking for support to join us as an extended community to preserve the legacy of our ancestors and the glorious fruits of their labors. We are still waiting for a reply from the diocese to see if they are willing to give Jeff Waite an extremely credible, independent internationally recognized preservation architect access to the building to perform an active use study. This will be done pro bono, I may add.

Christine Bulmer – 609 25<sup>th</sup> Street – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Bulmer stated that this proposal on 515 19<sup>th</sup> Street location reflects bad planning and complete disregard for the surrounding neighborhood. To its supporters I ask, what if this was your front yard? Where do we look for information? What adds to our quality of life, religion, history, the arts, great literature? While this proposal was drafted by a team of capable commercial developers it does little to inspire or uplift our community. For this reason I oppose to the destruction of a historic landmark an architectural gem and I oppose of a Price Chopper in its place. Someone from the New Yorker has said, “Every piece of architecture is an opportunity for experience” Some opportunities are banal, other are irritating and some will not communicate at all. Some will get comfort which is no small value. Some will tell you more eloquently than words of a human desire that they just want to connect to what has come before. To make it something different, to make it our own and speak to those who will follow us. What is there to follow if this plan moves forward? To the Watervliet City Council the following brief comments are provided to the City Council in response to the Nigro Supplemental Project Report submitted earlier this month. These comments are in addition to other written comments and letters in testimony to the Council from the Citizens for St. Patrick’s. (Attached are the eight (8) page comments).

Lori Sylvester – 1904 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Sylvester wanted to commend the photographer of the beautiful picture of the south façade of St. Patrick’s Church. Unfortunately, it does not tell the whole story of that property. I am wondering how we would feel if we saw all around the enlarged pictures of the other sides of the building. The rust, water damage, problem bricks, broken windows and graffiti that mark the rest of the site. The Nigro/Price Chopper plan is declined, I really dread the day when my tax dollars are used to tear the church down anyway because 20 or 30 years from now nobody has used it. It still going to be torn down because it has become a certified public eyesore and hazard. I hope that the Council does approve the zoning change. Even if the church were to be used for other commercial use it would still need to change the zoning, it would still be delivery trucks, parking issues and lighting issues. All of that would happen if the church were to be used for any other commercial enterprise anyway.

Brian Campbell – 1804 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Campbell stated that up until a couple of weeks ago I was the store manager at the Watervliet Price Chopper. I've been with Price Chopper for over 14 years. The store manager that replaced me has been with Price Chopper for over 35 years. There are many people in the building here that have 35 and even one lady with 52 years with Price Chopper. I think that says something about the character and quality of the company. Speaking from my own perspective I was there for 3 ½ years and I don't think there was a day that went by that a customer didn't ask for a fresh seafood item or a custom cut piece of meat or some other item that we just didn't have in the store. In addition we couldn't fit in the existing space we have. The people that work there want to take care of their customers and take care of the people in Watervliet. Unfortunately right now they are very limited in how they can do that. A new state of the art neighborhood sized Price Chopper would truly help them serve the needs of the community.

Mary Collett – 321 Boght Road – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Collett stated that the company has a plan speaks of preserving our history and encouraging neighborhoods and making Watervliet a place you want people to live. The preservation of St. Patrick's Church falls into the heart of that very statement, neighborhood, history and people. The people of the neighborhood surrounding the church have spoken thru word and pen. They reject the demolition, 40% filed a petition when 20% was required. They don't want to live across from a market and a parking lot. Considering our history our Council and the citizens of Watervliet continue to be bombarded with presentations from the Nigro and Price Chopper executives. There has not been one Council Meeting that afforded a presentation that is a preservationist. Say the folks who stood up this evening but who were cut off at two minutes. If the Council is to make a decision regarding this monument and its surrounding neighbors should we not have an architectural expert give a presentation that perhaps similar to the one from the Price Chopper folks. Would it not give you more information to base your decision? Let's hear a formal presentation from someone who can give more in site into what we really would be losing if we demolish St. Patrick's Church. This past week I looked thru the photos in the Metroland and Times Union and I saw pictures of the interior of the church, dismantled, pillaged and I thought goodness gracious is that what it looked like when it was being built over 120 years ago. Empty, the windows not in place, no rows, no organ, no people. What was there vision when they built it, what was their dream for it? God willing someone will come forward with a new vision and a new dream and they will be applauded for preserving St. Patrick's Church and the surrounding neighborhood.

John Johanson – 152 Mill Street – Troy, New York – Mr. Johanson stated that he believes in giving credit where credit is due. I think that there have been some improvements to this plan since the original planning. I think that improvements to a bad plan don't make a good plan. I think that the whole notion of demolishing the building just doesn't make any sense. I actually work for the Woodside Church it's a contemporary artist center which has taken over the Woodside Church in South Troy, New York. That building was scheduled for demolition in 2003-2004. At the time everyone said it is impossible, it is not possible that someone would want an old church in South Troy. It's not financially feasible, it's never going to happen. I'm glad to report that we just had construction this week and it's definitely very possible. It's not impossible to save these great churches with so many great examples of this happening throughout our region of this happening. I don't accept that line of reasoning. I do understand that the site of St. Patrick's Church is bigger. They should do a full five years of solid marketing reasonable adoptive reuse studies and real genuine effort to look at other options. I just see how the City should be making decision because of the zoning control of this great landmark. I think the City is not using that wisely. Currently it looks as if the City is headed in a direction that's not a wise use for that. The other thing I would say the people who built this church 100 years ago not only built a church but they built a space for the community. I appreciate the fact that the current church is having financial trouble. A lot of people but a lot of money and effort creating a legacy for passing down to our generation. There hasn't been enough due diligence finding alternatives for a better use of this property. From an urban planning standpoint Watervliet has some challenges, I 787 cut Watervliet off from the river. There is not a lot of quality open space. To take a beautiful piece of heritage iconic legacy the region shares. To do away with that would be urban planning suicide. It just doesn't make any sense. I just want to say that I disapprove of the zoning change in this respect until there has been full genuine marketing analysis. The Woodside Church organization came from Massachusetts it is not just a local issue. There are potential buyers around the country and region. I just don't see how we can support to have the building knocked down.

Donna Wellsworth – 1812 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Wellsworth stated that I am a fifth generation resident of Watervliet. I'm an active member of Immaculate Heart of Mary Church. Over 15 years as the religious coordinator and currently working three days a week in the food pantry. I oppose the demolition of St. Patrick's Church. There are only three churches like this in the world and St. Patrick's is the only one in the U.S.A. People travel the world to see architecture such as St. Patrick's. We are very fortunate to have church such as this in our neighborhood. To close your minds to the possibilities to enrich the City of Watervliet. Also, has the traffic engineer from Price Chopper spoke with the Chief of Police the safe route to school seeing that signs are located on 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue heading north.

Susan Holland – 89 Lexington Avenue – Albany, New York – Ms. Holland stated that she is the executive Director of the Historic Albany Foundation. I probably in this room have more experience than a lot of folks in adaptively reusing a church. I became the owner of St. Joseph's Church behind the Palace Theatre in Albany. We have raised so far without a use \$800,000.00 to stabilize the building between grants and individuals. This includes 3,500 corporations and individuals including Mr. John Nigro who is also a huge contributor to our church. Mayor Jennings from the City of Albany also contributed \$250,000.00 to its stabilization. We have been able to invite the public in use it for community. The problem we are having is getting a new use for it. We have a proposal for a brewery, but the big problem is not the church, the neighbors are in favor of keeping it in place as is. The problem is the reuse. We are going to work this out. We have been having dialog with the Community. We do not see this as a real problem. We see the same thing that could happen to St. Patrick's Church. Also, seeing that St. Patrick's is eligible for national Registry is very important. There are no churches like this anywhere or around here. It would definitely rip the heart out of this community. But the facts must also be present. In Historic Albany every time we have been approached about the reuse of the building we provide facts. We copy things and give people the information they need. I don't feel that with this large project before you to demolish not just the church but the rectory also and the other buildings there. You have an opportunity to get those facts straight, they are not straight now. That's what you need to do. A developer is not going to come forward until you actually get those facts straight. Again we provide those to the community. I also believe that the group that represents Historic Preservation groups across the state works on this every day across New York is going to be providing those numbers to the City Council and the Mayor. We are awaiting those figures now. Whether they are a little bit off we'll, but we really do need to look at this structure and have architect and other folks not employed by the diocese and Mr., Nigro go and look at them. Thank you very much.

John Broderick – 1881 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Broderick stated that his great-grandfather and great-great-grandfather and my great Uncle helped build the rectory and the church until recently. I've lived here all my life. Other families contributed to the contents and decorated the church. Others have donated to the roof, window repairs and maintenance that this iconic structure demanded over the years. Perhaps it's time to cut our losses and give in to the prospect of having a new grocery store selling you organic produce (which you can get already at the farmer's market). But before you give in to the dooms day rhetoric please consider some basic logic. The historic church structure was built from people of Watervliet representing our history and culture and holding value in every brick and arch and window that can't be easily valued or replaced. The Laws of Economics are not being obeyed when you tear down a viable structure to build something else. You have to take away brick and mortar being wasted, the energy to take this down and the energy it takes to replace it. It's not economically feasible. Especially when there is a reuse opportunity possible still. I have some questions about the new proposal. It looks good and my compliments on the additional retail space on 19<sup>th</sup> Street. What can we expect this to look like in the end?

These renditions tell one glimpse of what it will look like I see one angle possibly two. They weren't on the original proposal posted on the internet. The two story apartment building or a two story tall box just how integrated are you willing to make this to fit into the neighborhood that is currently there. Residential development is reportedly economically unfeasible according to my calculations. We do not need to demolish 23<sup>rd</sup> Street properties to save thousands of dollars and keeping a million dollars of taxable assets on the books and intact. As residential the most current resident property and commercial on 19<sup>th</sup> Street only is in keeping with the community and has no effect on the tax rolls since the residential tax property would offset the commercial tax property projections. Thank you for donating the McNeeley Bell and the historic content. To the Watervliet Historical Society it is a wonderful opportunity. What of the rest of what is left of the church, what id to come of that. The copper roof, the bricks that were donated by the community one at a time. The community ultimately has ownership of that property by its investment and heritage. Yet, we have no say in what happens with what is left of the church. There is a lot more than this than just bridging out a church with a store. You are taking away history and we are not replacing it with something of the same value. Nobody is going to come to see a store.

Patricia Fruscio – 2433 Broadway – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Fruscio stated Mayor Manning, Councilwoman Fogarty and Councilman Foglia first I would like to go on the record as being in favor of saving St. Patrick's. I have always been a person in favor of historic preservation. Second, I would like to say that I oppose rezoning a large residential area to construct a large market. I feel it will negatively affect Watervliet forever. As far as noise in the area just the increased truck traffic to any resident involved they will hear those trucks they will feel those trucks. Finally, I agree with the recommendation made at a previous meeting that the Price Chopper project should be decided by referendum on Election Day.

David Abate – 2129 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Abate stated that some of the comments tonight made changes were made to improve things from the neighbor's point of view. You are neighbors, were any of you consulted. So, I would like to know how you know this is our point of view. There will be no significant noise change, I was wondering have you – do you know what it sounds like at night here. I wonder if they obviously haven't spent much time at night here in the neighborhood because what you hear at night is crickets. I don't know how they think that by changing this won't affect the noise. Will there be adequate parking, if so where are the numbers. How many spaces did you survey? How many are going to be consumed? What will the change be? Where did you survey these spots? I know the Mayor likes numbers we will be inheriting numbers. We just want assurances that everything will be OK. There was comment that was made this project is neighborhood friendly. Those of you in the neighborhood do you find it friendly?

Lorraine Alund – 2127 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Alund stated that she is one of those people that have not been consulted about anything. This is one of those things that I'll be able to see from my kitchen, my yard, my bathroom and bedroom. Trucks, noise anything that we are not accustomed to. We have a lot of traffic on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue now but certainly with this in my back yard it will be awful. I lived at 2127 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue since birth, my mother lived there before me and her parents came from Ireland in 1880 and they helped to build this church. I am the only member of my family out of seven children that stayed in Watervliet. Several years ago I had a member of City Hall told me he couldn't understand why I was complaining. Why don't you get out, what do you want to stay here for? This is a person I grew up with, went to school with, that was his suggestion many years ago. But of course I didn't pay any attention to him. I stayed on. But now most people here tonight and most people in Watervliet know this is the most noticeable building in the City and certainly the most attractive building. The most beautiful church in the diocese. I don't think anyone in this building would disagree with that. What bothers me a lot lately is the passive attitude that people in Watervliet have. I just don't understand it. I do a lot of reading and I read something recently that Martin Luther King said about struggling and his situation. He said that it was the appalling silence of good people that will be the coolest legacy of the situation. That is what I think is happening here. Do the people want their families to remember the destruction of a wonderful place such as this? We all know 19<sup>th</sup> Street when I was growing up was beautiful and safe. Now more businesses are closing, we don't need two new stores on 19<sup>th</sup> Street. Who shops on 19<sup>th</sup> Street anyway? I don't know anybody, I certainly don't shop in Watervliet, there is nothing there I would even consider buying, not even gas. So I'm just wondering what will happen with this big box store and what will happen to me. People are asking me all the time what are you going to do? You can't continue living there not with a situation like this, at this stage of your life and your age. I don't know what I am going to do. I have no idea, I'm just hoping that you folks will consider this and think about people like me that are living there who put such an investment in their property and are wonderful neighbors. The Korean Church, what's going to happen to them, they have a large congregation? They all park on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, I don't know when the study was done, they certainly haven't done it on a weekend, when the church is in session. I just hope that you folks will look at this carefully and not rush to make a decision. Thank you.

Antoinette Delduce – 1806 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Delduce stated that I have read that disabled veterans to ride kayaks. To bring culture to the river, to bring a better balance to the river, to teach young people to ride kayaks. I think putting a small pool in the larger pool area would be very dangerous. To help people and bring culture to the City of Watervliet. This is what people look for. This is what people with young children look for. They came to Watervliet because it was a nice community. You are going to take something down that is beautiful not only to Watervliet residents but to Troy, Schenectady and Albany. People in Doctors offices look out windows and see the beautiful St. Patrick's Church and the cross. For many years people have stated that St. Patrick's is the beacon as you travel the highways and byways. Would you please think about what you will be taking away from the City of Watervliet, which is one of those things which are most loved by so many? There are so many people out there who are looking for you to make the right decision. It's not easy and it's not easy for the diocese to keep this up. Price Chopper has done a wonderful presentation, but I do not believe that the City of Watervliet needs a 40,200 square foot supermarket on 19<sup>th</sup> Street. Thank you for your time and god bless all of you.

Marion Fotache – 1554 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Fotache stated time travel with me for a minute. Moses was sent to deliver his people from bondage. There bondage captivity in Egypt. They looked to sacrifice and worship him. While he was on the mountain the people where in the valley worshipping the golden calf as they have in Egypt. He told them that because of the hardness they would wander for 40 years in the wilderness. Eventually, they came to their senses and to the Promised Land. Hope springs eternal. Now let's go to Lourdes, France in the mid 1800's. We found a little girl Bernadette, she sees the rose bush a flame. Bernadette was sent to a world in bondage and sin. She was sent to sat forget the islands of prosperity. Learn fresh to thirst for god. That is what Lourdes are about. Those miracles are simply a byproduct. Now we are going to come to Watervliet in the late 1800's. There is a priest Fr. Sheehan who's inspired by Lourdes. He was indeed a Fr., compassionate a provider a protector a guide for these people who came. Poor Irish immigrants arrive to the promise of three meals a day and a job. They had also suffered bondage centuries of problems in Ireland. Then a dreadful famine they would come to do grim, grinding work digging the Erie Canal. Then there was a concern for their spiritual needs. Bring the Sisters of Presentation here to care for their children who orphaned because of consumption and accidents. They would bring them to educate the children. This was the Victorian Age, they loved deeply, they built to last. Many Americans for example Emma Willard travel to Europe for ideas. She was very impressed with the cathedrals that dated back to before Columbus. They found the virtues of fidelity and integrity. Their architecture was not built overnight. It was furnished over decades. Under his leadership Fr. Sheehan and our catholic predecessors over 100 years ago built this magnificent edifice a place of worship which was inspired by Lourdes and named for the Patron of Ireland St. Patrick. This is a link to our past, our City's history. This is a jewel in a crown. When one is missing there is a gap. This gem the church of St. Patrick should not be missing from her crown.

Charles Collins – 609 23<sup>rd</sup> Street – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Mayor and City Council as Dave stated I am one of those people who live in the neighborhood. I live about 60 or 70 feet from the intersection of 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The back of that building is what I will see every morning when I come out and at night when I cut my lawn. Right now when I come out of my house what do I see a nice bunch of houses, I see the church and I see the school. This is what defines a neighborhood. This is not a neighborhood grocery store. This is a supermarket OK, I don't care what kind of spin you put on it. Believe me I have nothing against Price Chopper I think Price Chopper is a great market. I don't want to see price Chopper, Hannaford, Trader Joes or any kind of market built there. I don't want to see a big box store of any kind built there. I don't want to see Home Depot or Lowes, nothing. I want to see that church. Like so many people stated tonight there are viable solutions for this. It's the money, the money that's all they are thinking about money, it's all the church is thinking about the money. I've been living here since 1974, I was never a parishioner of St. Patrick's Church. I am a catholic, I do not go to the catholic churches. I go to St. Basil's Greek Orthodox Church in North Troy. That's where my family is. There are many times that sit out on my back deck and I can stand there and see the tower and the cross. Do you know how many days I have come out of there has been a storm with black clouds in the back. Then all of a sudden the sun shines thru. There is the steeple and the cross standing up. Nothing but sunshine and a black back drop. Where can you get this stuff? No matter when it happened it always gave me hope that whatever was going wrong with my life or what I was about to do there was hope. I had hope, I could see hope. Tearing down this church is going to take away the hope that I see for this City. Thank you.

Keith – 72 Alden Avenue – South Troy, New York – First of all thank you for renaming the park tonight. All military historians appreciate that. We teach what that man did. Also, thank you for a very local process in this whole manner. Please rezone. You guys brought it up earlier tonight, you have an unfunded mandate.

Helen Kuentzel - 1321 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. Kuentzel stated Mayor Manning, City Council and other City Officials, Fr. Diemeke and the Nigro/Golub Corporations. The facts are the facts. We don't want to believe them but this is what it is. Immaculate Heart of Mary has not to date received any viable offers other than the Nigro Group for St. Patrick's property. Now that the St. Patrick's property is in a state of complete despair. This is not the time to regret. This should have been taken care of by the parish 30 to 40 years ago. It's water under the bridge. Many people in Watervliet not only former St. Patrick's parishioners will miss this structure. The church must come down before it falls down or even worse. The Immaculate Heart of Mary cannot afford this expense any further. Has anyone else in this room other than Nigro Company come forward with a dime, I don't think so. Enough is enough. The Zoning Boards only concern should be the fact that the Nigro Group has answered every concern from the people and the Council. I don't understand the big fuss to rezone this property. After all there are at least 20 businesses from 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue to 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue. From a lawyer's office, Dunkin Doughnuts to a used car lot. We are not asking to put a porn shop in. We are in for a state of the art market. I thank Mayor Manning and the Council for their input and concern for Watervliet.

The concerns have been addressed. It's time for an answer. I extremely hope that the Council can come up with a favorable decision and the people of Watervliet can enjoy a state of the art market place.

Russell Giamba – 1813 Highland Avenue – Troy, New York – Mr. Giamba stated that he has been involved with urban planning as a citizen since the 1990's. I believe that this block of Watervliet should not be rezoned from residential to commercial business although 19<sup>th</sup> Street is a mixture of commercial and residential, 23<sup>rd</sup> Street is not. This project is not appropriate for this location. Not a 40,000 square foot regional grocery store that is a 24 hour operation. This is not a neighborhood grocery store as what was stated before. This is something people will be coming to for miles around. It doesn't have mom and pop living upstairs. It's a block wide and an unbroken wall for someone to look at. I don't think that 23<sup>rd</sup> Street should be turned into an alley for a regional grocery store. I think it will chase people out of this neighborhood. I think this parcel should remain residential. I'm not against a 24 hour grocery store. I think that Price Chopper is generally a pretty good store. A 24 hour store does not belong in a residential neighborhood. It belongs where people can move in and out and trucks can come and not be a negative factor for those that live there. What's even more important is what a magnificent church is on the site now. Probably the most beautiful and magnificent building in Watervliet. That's of supreme importance not only to the citizens of Watervliet but of thousands of people all over. Not only is the church there additionally, there is an elegant mansion which was the rectory. A substantial school and a row of six beautiful houses that are on the tax rolls. I ask the City Council and the Mayor let preservationists get in there. People who have had years of experience who can adequately assess what need to be done. I really question the figure. If you want alternate proposals you have to advertise. You just can't hope someone comes out of the woodwork. I know it's worth much more than a ½ million dollars. It's worth many millions of dollars. It couldn't be rebuilt today. Let us get in there and advertise. Save this treasure in Watervliet that so many people love.

Julia King – 1240 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Watervliet, New York – Ms. King stated to our Mayor and our Council and to Chief Boisvert and I would like to Thank the Nigro Company along with the Architects for the time and endeavors that you have spent for the people of Watervliet in trying to make this a go. I am definitely in favor of rezoning. I do respect each person's speeches tonight. I think we have the right to respect each other. I look at the church Sacred Heart of Mary was my parish and that was sold. Then I came to St. Patrick's and my theory is god is everywhere. I really would love to see the church come down. I would to see a market because we can benefit. That we would have a big market it would help with nutrition and our children our leaders of tomorrow. It would bring more jobs to the City and maybe businesses would be more attracted by all the people shopping. I think it can really help the City of Watervliet. I myself personally love to shop and I love Price Chopper and Shop Rite.

Pat Sivitch – 172 Sterling Avenue – Troy, New York – Ms. Sivitch stated that she is a parishioner of Immaculate Heart of Mary Church. I sure many of you in this room would love to see St. Patrick's remain standing, Let's get real. Not a single offer has come forward except for the Nigro Corporation on behalf of Golub. We have been doing this for over a year. You say try to get the word out, it seems to me there are a lot of people, Engineers, Preservation you name it there from all over tonight. The word must be all over. All this talk of restoration and not one offer. I also believe the duty of this City Council is not to get involved with the dispute the Citizens for St. Patrick's is having with the Bishop and Fr. Diemeke. The desire to take the church down is not the Council's concern. Thank you.

Bob Lewis – 18 1<sup>st</sup> Street – Watervliet, New York – Mr. Lewis stated that he has lived at 18 1<sup>st</sup> Street all his life, 80 years in October. We have a nice neighborhood and we keep our property up. I just t put a large deck on the house with a 42" TV. My wife said can you turn the TV down and I said I can't because of the sound coming off of I787 is terrible. You people are squawking about a little bit of noise come on down to where I live any day of the week to listen to the noise I get from I787.

Noel Olsen – 50 Maxwell Street – Albany, New York – Mr. Olsen stated that I am Director of real Property for the Roman Catholic Diocese. The Roman Catholic Diocese and the Watervliet/Green Island Catholic Community invited Mrs. Anderson and Mrs. Bulmer to select any one of three highly regarded independent structural engineering firms to evaluate the cost estimates that other independent professional engineers have invited to stabilize and rehabilitate St. Patrick's Church. They have declined the offer. They insisted there is only one architect qualified to assess the building and suggested the outcome of this assessment is already known. That the property is perfectly suitable to adaptive use and commercially and reasonable manner. #1 we agree with that, you can adapt any building reuse it, save it anytime, anyplace in the world. The question is what is the cost? We never said that you can't save this building, you can. Our Architect said it, our engineers have said it, and we are not disagreeing with that. We are just disagreeing with the costs, that's why we invited other engineering firms to come in and select one so we could do this. Plain and simple the Watervliet/Green Island Catholic Community can't afford the 4 million dollars and no one else has been able to do so. Thank you

Michael Kitner – 85 4<sup>th</sup> Street - Troy, New York – Mr. Kitner wants to address the Mayor and Council have you listen to me that there is a possibility that I am telling the truth. This building is the most significant structure in the City of Watervliet. The building is easily preservable. There are many viable economic feasible reuses for this building. This building contributes to the quality of life for the people in the community and for those who visit the community. The loss of this building is a disastrous blow to the character of the City. It would be counter contributing to the community.

It's worse than the Troy Art Work. This building renovated and providing viable service for the community will do more for the community than any new modern structure. This is important, destroying this building is wrong, it's outrageous, it's insane, it's counter cultural, it's unbelievable and yet it seems only three people can stop it, (You three). I can't imagine any culture in the world that would do this. It's like the Egyptians tearing down the pyramids, the Italians tearing down the Coliseum and the Leaning Tower of Pizza which is leaning or like painting over the Mona Lisa for another great piece of art work. It's crazy and it doesn't make sense. The Federal Government offers a 20% historic tax credit that's taxes you do not have to pay not a reduction of your income. It's a huge incentive. It's a US Policy overseen by the Secretary of the Interior to preserve and protect our architectural heritage. As representatives of the Government it is your duty to abide by this policy. If this building comes down it can never be replaced. I have many conversations with many people but I don't have a well-developed plan. I haven't talked to Noel who told me it is under contract he said you can give us a proposal but it's under contract. There is an existing contract between the church and Nigro Companies that's a fact and a blockade for any other developer. It appears it is in the best interest of the church and Nigro Companies to move forward with their plan. It is not in the best interest of the community. I believe it is in the best interest of the community for Nigro Company to alter their plan and take on their first preservation project. I believe they can still profit, if not step aside and let others come forward with a proposal that will serve the community in a far better way and let Watervliet be a better community. Let your conscience be your guide and stop this.

Mayor Manning thanked all in attendance for their comments this evening. Before closing the Public Hearing Mayor Manning requested Paul Goldman, Esq. to explain what happens going forward after tonight's meeting. Mr. Goldman explained that Joe Grasso of Clough harbor Associates and himself would be preparing an analysis of the Supplemental Report of the August 2012 presentation to the Council. The next thing I think we will talk about is part II of the SEQR. We will start working thru that and invite you to look at that. We have to make an independent analysis to review each of the components. So we will work thru that with you guys. We have to have some dialogue, debate it honestly and fairly for the record. I assume at the next meeting we will come back with some type of report on the August proposal, talk about SEQR.

There being no further comment, Mayor Manning closed the Public Hearing. Mayor Manning noted that all the other business for the meeting was concluded and that he would entertain a motion for adjournment.

A motion was made and seconded to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 9:40 P.M.

Respectfully Submitted,

Bruce A. Hidley  
City Clerk and Clerk to the Council